

LAW OFFICES  
**GOLDBERG, GODLES, WIENER & WRIGHT LLP**  
1229 NINETEENTH STREET, N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20036-2413

HENRY GOLDBERG  
JOSEPH A. GODLES  
JONATHAN L. WIENER  
DEVENDRA ("DAVE") KUMAR

HENRIETTA WRIGHT  
THOMAS G. GHERARDI, P.C.  
COUNSEL

THOMAS S. TYCZ\*  
SENIOR POLICY ADVISOR  
\*NOT AN ATTORNEY

(202) 429-4900  
TELECOPIER:  
(202) 429-4912  
e-mail:  
general@g2w2.com  
website: www.g2w2.com

October 9, 2015

**BY ELECTRONIC FILING**

Marlene H. Dortch  
Secretary  
Federal Communications Commission  
445 12th St., S.W.  
Washington, DC 20554

Re: Presentation in Expanding Access to Broadband and  
Encouraging Innovation through Establishment of an  
Air-Ground Mobile Broadband Secondary Service for  
Passengers Aboard Aircraft in the 14.0-14.5 GHz  
Band; GN Docket No. 13-114, RM-11640

Notification of *Ex Parte* Presentation

Dear Ms. Dortch:

On behalf of Space Exploration Technologies Corp. ("SpaceX"), we hereby submit correspondence responding to the comments of Gogo Inc. ("Gogo") in an *ex parte* letter filed on August 26, 2015, in the above referenced proceeding.

In particular, the SpaceX response addresses issues of Gogo's interference calculations and the Rise over Thermal interference threshold.

Please direct any questions related to this matter to the undersigned.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Henry Goldberg". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large, prominent "H" and "G".

Henry Goldberg  
*Counsel for*  
*Space Exploration Technologies Corp.*

October 9, 2015

Marlene H. Dortch  
Secretary  
Federal Communications Commission  
445 12th St., S.W.  
Washington, DC 20554

**Re: *Ex parte* Presentation in Expanding Access to Broadband and Encouraging Innovation through Establishment of an Air-Ground Mobile Broadband Secondary Service for Passengers Aboard Aircraft in the 14.0-14.5 GHz Band; GN Docket No. 13-114, RM-11640**

Dear Ms. Dortch:

Space Exploration Technologies Corp. (“SpaceX”) hereby responds to the comments of Gogo Inc. (“Gogo”) in an *ex parte* letter filed on August 26, 2015, in the above referenced proceeding. SpaceX addresses below both Gogo’s interference calculations and the Rise over Thermal (“RoT”) interference threshold that should be required to be controlled by the Air-Ground Mobile Broadband (“AGMB”) operator.

**I. Gogo’s Interference Calculations.**

SpaceX believes the worst case for interference is when the NGSO satellite is pointing the Rx beam at nadir (1150km range). Only one Qualcomm AGMB ground station would be within the NGSO beam and for the worst case we assume it is at the spot center. The AGMB ground station antenna sidelobes radiate straight into the NGSO Rx beam and there is no gain roll-off on satellite’s Rx antenna (interference comes right at beam center). In this case:

<b>GS EIRP per Beam Per Polarization [dBW]</b>	39.5
<b>Sidelobe attenuation [dB]</b>	-37
<b>Atmospheric Loss at Ku Band [dB]</b>	0
<b>Satellite G/T [dB/K]</b>	13
<b>Sat Beam Gain Roll-off [dB]</b>	0
<b>1/BW (BW = 50 MHz) [dB Hz]</b>	-76.99
<b>1/Boltzmann [dB/K Hz]</b>	228.60
<b>Path Loss (at nadir) [dB]</b>	-176.58
<b>Polarization Discrimination [dB]</b>	-3
<b>Only one Ground Station (no reuse) [dB]</b>	0
<b>I/N at Satellite Receiver [dB]</b>	-12.47
<b>RoT [%]</b>	<b>5.67%</b>

Note the calculations above are based on sidelobe attenuation numbers indicated in Qualcomm's petition. Gogo uses somewhat lower sidelobes numbers, apparently taken from Qualcomm's published antenna patterns.<sup>1</sup> Using those numbers and the worst case assumptions above:

<b>GS EIRP per Beam Per Pol [dBW]</b>	39.5
<b>sidelobe attenuation [dB]</b>	-40
<b>Atmospheric Loss at Ku Band [dB]</b>	0
<b>Satellite G/T [dB/K]</b>	13

<sup>1</sup> See, Petition for Rulemaking of Qualcomm, RM-11640, App. A; see also Letter from Dean Brenner, Vice President, Qualcomm, to Marlene Dortch, Secretary, FCC, RM-11640 (Sept. 11, 2012), Att. A (antenna pattern data spreadsheets).

<b>Sat Beam Gain Roll-off [dB]</b>	0
<b>1/BW (BW = 50 MHz) [dB Hz]</b>	-76.99
<b>1/Boltzmann [dB/K Hz]</b>	228.60
<b>Path Loss (at nadir) [dB]</b>	-176.58
<b>Polarization Discrimination [dB]</b>	-3
<b>Only one Ground Station (no reuse) [dB]</b>	0
<b>I/N at Satellite Receiver [dB]</b>	-15.47
<b>RoT [%]</b>	<b>2.84%</b>

RoT is lower, but still in excess of the allowed 1%.

For interference from aircraft, there could be up to four aircraft<sup>2</sup> within the illuminated spot and the aircraft antennas sidelobes radiate straight into the NGSO Rx beam (no gain roll-off on satellite's Rx antenna). Using the numbers shown in Qualcomm's original petition:

<b>Plane EIRP [dBW]</b>	3
<b>Plane antenna Roll-off toward NGSO Sat at nadir [dB]</b>	-20
<b>Atmospheric Loss at Ku Band [dB]</b>	0
<b>Satellite G/T [dB/K]</b>	13
<b>Sat Beam Gain Roll-off [dB]</b>	0
<b>1/BW (BW = 2 MHz) [dB Hz]</b>	-63.01
<b>1/Boltzmann [dB/K Hz]</b>	228.60
<b>Path Loss (at nadir) [dB]</b>	-176.58

<sup>2</sup> The Space X spot beam is approximately 40 Km in diameter. We assumed four airplanes will be using the AGMB system at cruising altitude within a SpaceX spot beam at any time. Hence we assume a frequency reuse factor of 4 within the spot beam.

<b>Polarization Discrimination [dB]</b>	-3
<b>4 Reuses of 2 MHz Carrier in NGSO beam coverage area [dB]</b>	6.02
<b>I/N at Satellite Receiver [dB]</b>	-11.97
<b>RoT [%]</b>	<b>6.36%</b>

Or with Gogo's numbers:

<b>Plane EIRP [dBW]</b>	3
<b>Plane antenna Roll-off toward NGSO Sat at nadir [dB]</b>	-28
<b>Atmospheric Loss at Ku Band [dB]</b>	0
<b>Satellite G/T [dB/K]</b>	13
<b>Sat Beam Gain Roll-off [dB]</b>	0
<b>1/BW (BW = 2 MHz) [dB Hz]</b>	-63.01
<b>1/Boltzmann [dB/K Hz]</b>	228.60
<b>Path Loss (at nadir) [dB]</b>	-176.58
<b>Polarization Discrimination [dB]</b>	-3
<b>4 Reuses of 2 MHz Carrier in NGSO beam coverage area [dB]</b>	6.02
<b>I/N at Satellite Receiver [dB]</b>	-19.97
<b>RoT [%]</b>	<b>1.01%</b>

In both cases, a higher sidelobe suppression is required in order to meet the 1% RoT requirement for the FSS link budget set out in ITU Recommendation S.1432.

## II. The RoT Interference Threshold.

As stated in a joint *ex parte* letter filed on October 7, 2015, SpaceX and Qualcomm have agreed that, given that, at present, the AGMB service will be the only non-primary use of the band, the AGMB operator should control RoT to NGSO satellite systems to ensure that

