

**Before the  
FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION  
Washington, D.C. 20554-0005**

In the Matter of )  
 )  
Digital Audio Broadcasting Systems )  
And Their Impact on the Terrestrial ) MM Docket No. 99-325  
Radio Broadcast Service )

To: The Commission

**REPLY TO OPPOSITION OF NATIONAL PUBLIC RADIO  
TO APPLICATION FOR REVIEW**

1. My name is Jonathan E. Hardis, and on April 8, pursuant to [§ 1.115](#) of the Commission's rules, I applied for review of an Order adopted by Media Bureau under delegated authority in the above captioned proceeding.<sup>1-2</sup> National Public Radio has filed an opposition,<sup>3</sup> and I reply to it herein pursuant to [§ 1.115\(d\)](#).

2. NPR begins by claiming (at p. 2) that consideration of the first question in the Application for Review "is precluded by the Commission Rules" because "at no time did he challenge the Bureau's authority to authorize a 10 dB or other power increase." This argument fails on two grounds. As a general principle, the purpose of public comment is to bring to an agency's attention facts and other information about which it might not have previously known. There is no need in public comment to inform an agency about its own rules and procedures

---

<sup>1</sup> [DA 10-208](#), Adopted January 27, 2010, Released January 29, 2010. Electronically at [http://hraunfoss.fcc.gov/edocs\\_public/attachmatch/DA-10-208A1.pdf](http://hraunfoss.fcc.gov/edocs_public/attachmatch/DA-10-208A1.pdf). Hereinafter, the "Order." See also [75 FR 17874](#), April 8, 2010.

<sup>2</sup> Application for Review of Jonathan E. Hardis ("Application for Review"), April 8, 2010, MM Docket No. 99-325; at <http://fjallfoss.fcc.gov/ecfs/document/view?id=7020408278>.

<sup>3</sup> *Opposition of National Public Radio to Application for Review*, ("Opposition") April 23, 2010, MM Docket No. 99-325. As of the evening of April 27, copy has not yet appeared on the ECFS.

because they are already authoritative on them. However, in the instant matter, this is a moot point. Prior to issuance of the *Order* I had no indication that Media Bureau would issue a final order in a rulemaking proceeding on its own, notwithstanding [§ 0.283\(a\)](#) of the Commission’s rules, which requires it to be referred to the Commission en banc for disposition. This is the first opportunity to object. NPR’s discussion of [§ 0.61](#) is all well and good, but it fails to distinguish between those matters on which Media Bureau “advises and recommends to the Commission,” and those where it “acts for the Commission under delegated authority.”

3. NPR proceeds (at p. 6) to reiterate the rational for a power increase. While argument on technical points is best left for future public comment, I say again that under NPR’s own data analysis in their Advanced IBOC Coverage and Compatibility Study (AICCS), any power level above –20 dBc did not, in fact, “avoid[] interference to protected analog service.”<sup>4</sup> Furthermore, the record is indeed “abundantly clear” that –20 dBc is sufficient level of power to replicate analog coverage, provided that the receiver meets the technical requirements of the *de facto* standard adopted by the Commission. These are the technical characteristics of the prototype receiver as tested, which were well documented.<sup>5</sup>

4. On the second question in the *Application for Review*, concerning a public comment requirement for the AICCS report, NPR does not dispute the fact that the *Order* takes credibility from its proximity to the AICCS report. (Neither does NPR dispute that the *Order* did not consider the report’s actual experimental data and technical findings.) Instead, NPR merely argues that *ARRL v. FCC* is inapposite because it concerned a study conducted by *commission staff*, whereas AICCS was an NPR study. NPR is quite right that, in most cases, rules challenges based on lack of public review of technical studies and data have arisen from in-house research

---

<sup>4</sup> See, Application for Review at 34.

<sup>5</sup> See, Application for Review at 5.

conducted by the agencies themselves. However, the venue of the study has never been the controlling issue. *Chamber of Commerce v. SEC*, for example, concerned privately produced “Management Practice Inc. Bulletin[s].”<sup>6-7</sup> The issue is the opportunity for public comment about technical studies relied upon for rulemaking, regardless of their source.

5. The circumstances here are perhaps unique in that a major study—one specifically designed for the rulemaking at hand—was conducted while the rulemaking was ongoing and was completed so late in the process. Nonetheless, Media Bureau declared that, “[w]e have reviewed the AICCS Project Report, the Agreement submitted by NPR and iBiquity, the *MAP 2010 Ex Parte* and the *Jurison Comments*,” the later three being derivatives of the AICCS. “Based on our analysis of these documents and data ... we are convinced that an immediate voluntary 6 dB increase in FM Digital ERP is appropriate for all FM stations except super-powered FM stations.” (*Order* at 15) This demonstrates conclusively that solicited public comment on the AICCS is required—regardless of previous comment that was solicited, and regardless of any ex parte comments that might have been received.

6. On this latter point, NPR faults me for not, myself, providing ex parte comments on the AICCS report. Citing *Echostar Satellite, LLC v. FCC*, they say that I had “ample opportunity.” In fact, I had every reason to expect that an additional comment period would be opened prior to issuance of a final order, as did others.<sup>8</sup> In *Echostar*, there was a comment period in which the results of the NAB/AMST study were available for discussion, and there was no

---

<sup>6</sup> *Chamber of Commerce v. SEC*, 443 F.3d 890 (D.C. Cir. 2006), online at <http://pacer.cadc.uscourts.gov/docs/common/opinions/200604/05-1240a.pdf>.

<sup>7</sup> Ironically, later in the same paragraph NPR cites *Echostar Satellite, LLC v. FCC*, which concerned data generated by the NAB and the ASMT, rather than the Commission itself.

<sup>8</sup> “It will take additional time for the Commission to receive the [AICCS] report and make it available for public comment. This entire process could take several months. Interested parties will then need to be given the opportunity to file comments and reply comments.” Comments of iBiquity Digital Corp., at pp. 6–7, July 6, 2009, MM Docket No. 99–325, electronically at <http://fjallfoss.fcc.gov/ecfs/document/view?id=7019808294>

expectation that there would be another. (The controversy in *Echostar* pertained to access to the raw data behind the study, which is not at issue here.) Furthermore, public comment is not something allowed for my personal benefit. Public comment is for the benefit of the agency, and perhaps later the courts, to acquire the broad swatch of knowledge that is required to make good decisions.<sup>9</sup> Whether or not I personally chose to provide ex parte comments is totally irrelevant.

7. On the third question in the *Application for Review*, on whether the Order involves questions of law and policy that the Commission has not yet decided, NPR missed the point. They provided inapposite and incorrect analyses of both the *Application for Review* and the earlier Petitions for Reconsideration (PFRs). I am sorry if I was unclear. The actual issue, on which NPR did not comment, is that of exhaustion of administrative remedy with respect to the pending PFRs. Since the Commission (though delegated authority, if upheld) has reexamined its prior positions and reaffirmed them in a separate rulemaking, the *Order* constitutes conclusion of vicarious reconsideration. It evidences that the Commission had its “opportunity” to pass on questions of fact and law. (47 U.S.C. 405) Whatever the ultimate fate of the *Order* itself, after its own provisions are tested in reconsideration and appeal, its demonstration that the *Second Report and Order* was reconsidered will remain intact.

8. NPR construes a stay of the *Order* as something based on the merits of ultimately defeating the *Order*. (*Opposition* at Fn. 38) However, that would not be its role here. *Darby v. Cisneros*<sup>10</sup> lays out the two methods by which an agency can avoid administrative finality for decisions under the Administrative Procedure Act: having a rule requiring agency appeals (which the Commission does), or providing that the decision will be inoperative (stayed) pending

---

<sup>9</sup> Congress prescribed APA procedures “to ensure that the broadest base of information would be provided to the agency by those most interested and perhaps best informed on the subject of the rulemaking at hand.” (*Brown Express, Inc. v. United States*, 607 F.2d 695, 701 (5th Cir. 1979).)

<sup>10</sup> *Darby et al. v. Cisneros et al.*, 509 U.S. 137 (1993)

agency appeal. With respect to the *Second Report and Order*, what I am suggesting is that if the Commission wishes to continue to avoid finality, its reconsideration having been effectively completed, a stay is the other route available. Since it would make no sense to stay an action that was just affirmed on reconsideration, what I am suggesting is that a stay of the *Order* instead would also avoid finality. That is, with respect to the *Order*, one cannot require mandatory reconsideration of whether or not it reconsidered a prior issue. However, if it did so inadvertently or inadvertently, then it might be stayed by higher authority. I believe I might be obligated under § 1.115(b)(2)(ii) and § 1.115(k) to pop up the button box that says, “You are about to make the *Second Report and Order* administratively final. Are You Sure?” This ensures that the Commission itself has been properly notified and has been given opportunity to act.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Jonathan E. Hardis". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large initial 'J'.

Jonathan E. Hardis  
356 Chestertown St.  
Gaithersburg, MD 20878–5724

Dated: April 28, 2010

hardis@alum.mit.edu

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, Jonathan E. Hardis, hereby certify that true and correct copies of the foregoing *Reply to Opposition of National Public Radio to Application for Review* were sent this 28<sup>th</sup> day of April, 2010, via the ECFS and first class mail, postage prepaid, to:

Gregory A. Lewis  
Associate General Counsel  
National Public Radio, Inc.  
635 Massachusetts Ave. NW  
Washington, DC 20001-3753

William T. Lake  
Chief, Media Bureau  
Federal Communications Commission  
445 12th Street SW  
Washington, DC 20554-0005

Albert Shuldiner  
Senior Vice President and General Counsel  
iBiquity Digital Corporation  
6711 Columbia Gateway Dr., Ste. 500  
Columbia, MD 21046-2549

Robert A. Mazer  
Vinson & Elkins, LLP  
1455 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Ste. 600  
Washington, DC 20004-1013

*Counsel for iBiquity Digital Corporation*

Jane E. Mago  
Executive Vice President and General  
Counsel, Legal and Regulatory Affairs  
National Association of Broadcasters  
1771 N Street NW  
Washington, DC 20036-2800

Marvin Ammori  
Free Press  
501 Third Street NW, Ste 875  
Washington, DC 20001-2760

Parul Desai  
Media Access Project  
1625 K Street NW, Ste 1000  
Washington, DC 20006-1683

*Counsel for Prometheus Radio Project  
Nat'l Federation of Community Broadcasters  
New America Foundation*

Steven A. Lerman  
Lerman Senter PLLC  
2000 K Street NW, Ste. 600  
Washington, DC 20006-1809

*Counsel for American Public Media  
Backyard Broadcasting, LLC  
Beasley Broadcast Group, Inc.  
Bonneville International Corp.  
Black Crow Media Group, LLC  
Emmis Communications Corporation  
Entercom Communications Corp.  
Harris Corporation  
Journal Broadcast Corporation  
Broadcast Electronics, Inc.  
Commonwealth Broadcasting Corporation  
Continental Electronics Corp.  
Cox Radio, Inc.  
Lincoln Financial Media Company  
Nassau Broadcasting Partners, LP  
Nautel Maine, Inc.  
NRG Media, Inc.  
Sacred Heart University, Inc.  
CBS Radio, Inc.  
Greater Media, Inc.  
Commonwealth Broadcasting Corporation*

*Charles River Broadcasting Co. (WKLB-FM)*

Angela J. Campbell  
Institute for Public Representation  
Georgetown University Law Center  
600 New Jersey Ave. NW  
Washington, DC 20001–2022

*Counsel for New America Foundation*  
*Prometheus Radio Project*  
*Benton Foundation*  
*Common Cause*  
*Center for Digital Democracy*  
*Center for Governmental Studies*

Alan W. Jurison  
545 Grant Blvd.  
Syracuse, NY 13203–1150

Clear Channel Communications, Inc.  
8044 Montgomery Rd., Suite 650  
Cincinnati, OH 45236–2959

John Wells King  
Garvey Schubert Barer  
1000 Potomac St. NW, Ste 500  
Washington, DC 20007–3592

*Counsel for Rhode Island Public Radio*

Educational Information Corporation  
c/o Deborah S. Proctor  
PO Box 828  
Wake Forest, NC 27588–0828

Association of Public Radio Engineers, Inc.  
c/o Dan Mansergh  
KQED Public Radio  
2601 Mariposa Street  
San Francisco, CA 94110

Michael Couzens  
Michael Couzens Law Office  
PO Box 3642  
Oakland, CA 94609

*Counsel for Nevada City Community*  
*Broadcast Group, Inc.*

Marshfield Broadcasting Company, Inc.  
130 Enterprise Drive  
Marshfield, MA 02050

Jeffrey D. Southmayd  
Southmayd & Miller  
4 Ocean Ridge Boulevard South  
Palm Coast, FL 32137

*Counsel for Augusta Radio Fellowship*  
*Institute, Inc.*  
*Houston Christian Broadcasters, Inc.*  
*The Moody Bible Institute of Chicago*

Paul Dean Ford, P.E.  
18889 North 2350th Street  
Dennison, IL 62426–2523

David Noble  
Intl Assn of Audio Information Services  
2323 W 14th Street  
Tempe, AZ 85281

Communications Center of  
Minnesota State Services for the Blind  
2200 University Ave W, Ste 240  
St. Paul, MN 55114

John Joseph McVeigh  
J.J. McVeigh, Attorney at Law  
16230 Fall Road  
PO Box 128  
Butler, MD 21023–0128

*Counsel for Talley Broadcasting Corporation*  
*Klein Broadcast Engineering, LLC*

Donald G. Everist  
Cohen, Dippell and Everist, P.C.  
1300 L Street NW, Suite 1100  
Washington, DC 20005–4183

Jamie Hedlund  
Consumer Electronics Association  
1919 South Eads Street  
Arlington, VA 22202

George R. Borsari, Jr.  
Borsari & Paxson  
4000 Albemarle St NW, Ste 100  
Washington, DC 20016

*Counsel for National Translator Association*

Stephen Shultis  
WNYC Radio  
160 Varick Street  
New York, NY 10013

Peter Tannenwald  
Fletcher, Heald & Hildreth, PLC  
1300 N. 17th Street, 11th Floor  
Arlington, VA 22209-3801

*Counsel for Brown Broadcasting Service,  
Inc.*

Mark D. Humphrey  
PO Box 307  
Exton, PA 19341

The Livingston Radio, Co. (WHMI-FM)  
PO Box 935  
Howell, MI 48844-0935

David D. Oxenford  
Davis Wright Tremaine LLP  
1919 Pennsylvania Ave NW, Suite 200  
Washington, DC 20006-3402

*Counsel for Educational Media Foundation*

John J. Mullaney  
Mullaney Engineering, Inc.  
9049 Shady Grove Court  
Gaithersburg, MD 20877

Charles Keiler  
6711 NW 26 Way  
Fort Lauderdale, FL 33309

Mitzi T. Gramling  
Minnesota Public Radio  
480 Cedar Street  
Saint Paul, MN 55101

BMW of North America  
PO Box 1227  
Westwood, NJ 07675-1227

Robert B. Jacobi  
Cohn and Marks, LLP  
1920 N Street NW, Ste 300  
Washington, DC 20036

*Counsel for Mt. Wilson FM Broadcasters,  
Inc.*

Ford Motor Company  
Building 5, Room 2G055  
20300 Rotunda Drive  
Dearborn, MI 48124-3900

Paul S. Lotsof  
PO Box 18899  
Tucson, AZ 85731

Executive Director, WDIY-FM Radio  
Lehigh Valley Community Broadcasters  
Association (WDIY-FM)  
301 Broadway  
Bethlehem, PA 18015

Julian H. Booker  
Delmarva Broadcasting Company  
PO Box 7492  
Wilmington, DE 19803

WOLF Radio, Inc.  
401 W. Kirkpatrick Street  
Syracuse, NY 13204

Douglas L. Vernier  
V-Soft Communications, LLC  
721 W First Street, Suite A  
Cedar Falls, IA 50613

Edgar C. Reihl, P.E.  
1715 Illinois Road  
Northbrook, IL 60062

Leigh Robartes  
124 S. Polk Street  
Moscow, ID 83843

Gammon & Grange, PC  
8280 Greensboro Drive, FL 7  
McLean, VA 22102–3807

*Counsel for Radio Training Network, Inc.*

Hampton Roads Educational  
Telecommunication Association, Inc.  
5200 Hampton Boulevard  
Norfolk, VA 23508

Brian Kirby  
2222 Wellington Ct  
Lisle, IL 60532

Robert M. Fiocchi  
303 W Prospect Street  
Rhineland, WI 54501

Jeff Johnson  
301 Landrum  
Northern Kentucky University  
Highland Heights, KY 41099

Bernard Wise  
1306 River Street  
Valatie, NY 12184

Ralph J. Carlson  
Carlson Communications, International  
PO Box 57760  
Salt Lake City, UT 84157

Brian J. Henry  
1414 Hill Avenue  
Napa, CA 94559–1528

John W. Haralson  
420 S. Marion Parkway, No. 1401  
Denver, CO 80209–2549

William Cordell  
866 N. Wilcrest  
Houston, TX 77079

Cary S. Tepper, PC  
Booth, Freret Implay & Tepper, PC  
7900 Wisconsin Avenue, Ste 304  
Bethesda, MD 20814–3628

*Counsel for Positive Alternative Radio, Inc.  
Creative Educational Media Corp., Inc.  
Calvary Chapel of Twin Falls, Inc.  
Seton Hall University (WSOU-FM)*

Clayton Roberts  
Mars Hill Broadcasting Co., Inc.  
4044 Makyes Road  
Syracuse, NY 13215

Barry D. McLarnon  
2696 Regina Street  
Ottawa, ON K2B 6Y1  
CANADA

H. Donald Messer  
6425 31st Place NW  
Washington, DC 20015

Aaron Read  
300 Pulteney Street  
Geneva, NY 14456

Aaron Read  
20 Leeward Lane  
Canandaigua, NY 14424–2482

James S. Bumpous  
Yellow Dog Radio  
Big Bend Broadcasting  
306 West Broadway  
Silver City, NM 88061

Tim Houser  
10908 N. Thornydale Road  
Tucson, AZ 85742

Robert D. Young, Jr.  
33 S. Main Street, Apt. 2B  
Millbury, MA 01527-3170

Ann Lynch  
5624 Wood Street  
Port Orange, FL 32127

Chris Kantack  
1353 Sudden Valley  
Bellingham, WA 98229

Brian Gregory  
10035 Kendale Road  
Potomac, MD 20854

Brian Gregory  
7448 Cinnabar Terrace  
Gaithersburg, MD 20879

Gregory Smith  
7448 Cinnabar Terrace  
Gaithersburg, MD 20853

Sid Shumate  
Givens & Bell, Inc.  
1897 Ridge Road  
Haymarket, VA 20169

Robert R. Hawkins  
6623 W. State Road 252  
Edinburgh, IN 46124

Broadcaster Traffic Consortium, LLC  
2000 K Street NW, Ste 600  
Washington, DC 20006-1809

David Burnett  
Good Shepherd Radio Incorporated  
825 Washington Street  
Columbus, TN 47201

Michael Gehring  
1974 Sherman Drive  
Columbus, OH 47203

WFCR, Amherst, Massachusetts  
Hampshire House  
131 County Circle  
University of Massachusetts  
Amherst, MA 01003-9257

Press Communications, LLC  
1329 Campus Parkway  
Neptune, NJ 07753

Edward Czelada  
3302 N. Van Dyke Road  
Imlay City, MI 48444

James Davis  
4325 62nd Court  
Vero Beach, FL 32967

Leroy C. Granlund  
7455 Ridgeview Lane  
Penryn, CA 95663-9537

James M. Wilhelm  
10 Matthew Drive  
Fairmont, WV 26554

V -Soft Communications, LLC  
401 Main Street, Ste 213  
Cedar Falls, IA 50613

Peter Tannenwald  
Fletcher, Heald & Hildreth, PLC  
1300 N 17th Street, FL 11  
Arlington, VA 22209-3801

*Counsel for American University (WAMU)*

Public Radio Regional Organizations  
c/o KPLU, Pacific Lutheran University  
Tacoma, WA 98447

Jeffrey Freeland Nelson  
American Public Media Group  
480 Cedar Street  
Saint Paul, MN 55101

Cavell, Mertz & Associates, Inc.  
7839 Ashton Avenue  
Manassas, VA 20109

Tom Godell  
WUKY Public Radio  
340 McVey Hall  
University of Kentucky  
Lexington, KY 40506-0045

Barry A. Friedman  
Thompson Hine LLP  
1920 M Street NW, Ste 800  
Washington, DC 20036

*Counsel for Entravision Holdings, LLC*

University Station Alliance (Craig Beeby)  
1017 W Brooke Hollow Ct  
Stillwater, OK 74075

James W. Anderson  
253 North 500 West  
Provo, UT 84601-2689

Steve Johnston  
Wisconsin Public Radio  
821 University Avenue  
Madison, WI 53706

Henry Ruhwiedel  
5317 W 133rd Avenue  
Crown Point, IN 46307

Delmarva Broadcasting Company  
PO Box 7492  
Wilmington, DE 19803

John A. Buffaloe  
118 Clark Place  
Memphis, TN 38104

Daniel Houg, Chief Engineer  
KAXE-FM  
260 NE 2nd Street  
Grand Rapids, MN 55744

G. Craig Hanson  
Simmons Media Group, LLC  
515 S. 700 E. #1C  
Salt Lake City, UT 84102

Steven Glenn Daniel  
551 Rugby Road  
Brooklyn, NY 11230

Roy H. Fisk  
PO Box 545  
Twain Harte, CA 95383-0545

Kevin Redding  
530 Asher Loop  
Adamsville, TN 38310

Original and 9 copies, pursuant to § 1.419, to:

Marlene H. Dortch, Secretary  
Federal Communications Commission  
Office of the Secretary  
445 12th Street SW  
Washington, DC 20554-0005



Jonathan E. Hardis