



**Joan Marsh**  
Vice President –  
Federal Regulatory

AT&T Services, Inc.  
1120 20<sup>th</sup> Street, N.W.  
Suite 1000  
Washington, D.C. 20036

202.457.3120 Phone  
832.213.0172 Fax  
joanmariemarsh@att.com

December 11, 2012

Ms. Marlene H. Dortch  
Secretary  
Federal Communications Commission  
445 12<sup>th</sup> Street S.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20554

**Re:** *In the Matter of Expanding the Economic and Innovation Opportunities of Spectrum Through Incentive Auctions*, GN Docket No. 12-268  
**NOTICE OF ORAL EX PARTE PRESENTATION**

Dear Ms. Dortch:

On Friday, December 7, 2012, Joan Marsh, Brian Benison, and Michael Goggin (all from AT&T), David Lawson (Sidley Austin), Jon Nuechterlein (WilmerHale), Eric DeSilva (Wiley Rein), Phil Haile (Yale University), Michael Kearns (University of Pennsylvania) and Yeon-Koo Che (Columbia University) met by telephone conference with Ruth Milkman (Chief of the Wireless Telecommunications Bureau), Gary Epstein (Senior Advisor and Chair of the Incentive Auctions Task Force), Edward Smith (of the Task Force) Evan Kwerel (Office of Strategic Planning), Brett Tarnutzer, Sasha Javid and Martha Stancill (all of the Wireless Telecommunications Bureau), Rebecca Hanson (Media Bureau), and with the Commission's outside consultants: Paul Milgrom (Stanford University) and Lawrence Ausubel (University of Maryland).

The purpose of the call was to exchange ideas on auction design and related issues. First, we discussed issues relating to the reverse auction, including proposals for multi-pass and single-pass descending clock auctions and for a sealed-bid alternative. We further addressed the relationship between those auction-structure options and mechanisms for optimizing the repacking process. Second, we discussed issues concerning the forward auction, including package bidding, spectrum contiguity (both vertical and horizontal), and assignment-phase mechanisms. Third, we discussed issues relating to the closing rules, including the possibility of continued bidding in both the reverse and forward auctions after both excess supply and demand are eliminated for a given channel-clearing target but the auction-closing requirement remains unmet. AT&T emphasized that its examination of these issues is in the early stages, and that AT&T has

Marlene H. Dortch  
December 11, 2012  
Page 2

not drawn any conclusions as to their impact, or which auction design/options would be optimal.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'JM', with a long horizontal line extending to the right.

Joan Marsh

cc: Ruth Milkman  
Gary Epstein  
Edward Smith  
Evan Kwerel  
Brett Tarnutzer  
Sasha Javid  
Martha Stancill  
Rebecca Hanson  
Paul Milgrom  
Lawrence Ausubel